

# RANKING OF STATES – TOTAL SCORES

## for Program and Oversight Benchmarks Combined

NACCRRA chose 16 key elements essential for quality small family child care homes. Fifty-one states (including the District of Columbia) and the Department of Defense (DoD) were assessed, assigned points based on state regulations and policies and ranked based on their performance. A small family child care home is defined as a child care setting in which up to six children, including those of the caregiver under age 6, are cared for in the home of the provider for compensation.

The lowest level of required licensing/regulation was scored. Regulations were not scored unless they were required for all family child care homes in that category.

Many states have family child care homes that voluntarily agree to regulation or become regulated either because of the higher quality associated with licensing or to receive public subsidy funding. In Texas, the category of family child care where all family child care providers are required to be listed with the Department of Family and Protective Services was scored. A certificate is issued after a background check clearance.

States could receive a maximum of 10 points for each of the areas scored or partial credit based on state requirements. Based on the number of children allowed before licensing begins, NACCRRA used a sliding fractional scale to arrive at the final score. The total maximum points a state could receive is 150.

States were ranked based on their total scores.

This report was finalized in February, 2012. Some states and DoD have pending

changes that are scheduled to take place in 2012 after this report went to press.

- The average score in 2012 was 69 out of a possible 150 points.
- *Oklahoma* has the top score, at 120 points out of a possible 150, which is about 80 percent, closely followed by *Washington* at 119. *Kansas* is at third place with 111 points. *Delaware* is at fourth place with 109 points.
- If graded on a letter grade scale, the top state (*Oklahoma*) would earn a “B”. The next three states (*Washington*, *Kansas* and *Delaware*) and DoD would earn a “C.” All the rest of the states, including *Massachusetts* at number 10 with a score of 86, 57 percent of total points, earn a failing grade.
- *Kansas* had a dramatic change from 2010, when the state scored zero. *Kansas* made changes in both program and oversight areas. These changes were a result of enactment of “Lexie’s Law”, passed in 2010, which included a requirement that all small family child care homes be licensed and inspected. Significant collaboration at the state level resulted in additional changes to program requirements that became effective in February 2012.
- Just below the top ten, *Georgia* came in at 11th, with another dramatic improvement from zero in 2010 to 84 out of 150 in 2012. This came about from changes in legislation, including the requirement of an inspection before licensing of small family child care homes.

- Seven states (*Colorado, Delaware, District of Columbia, Kansas, Maryland, Oklahoma and Washington*) and *DoD* scored high on both licensing requirements and oversight.
- *Massachusetts* has a particularly low score on oversight with six points (ranked 33rd). This is in contrast to its program standards, which are stronger with 80 points (tied for 4<sup>th</sup> place). If its oversight were as strong as its program standards, *Massachusetts* would score a passing grade.
- Weak oversight guts strong program requirements. Conversely, weak program requirements make strong oversight less effective.
- *Michigan* would score in the top five if the strength of its oversight policies matched its program requirements. Because the state does not inspect before licensing, it scored a zero.

Sixteen states received a score of zero.

- Eight of these states received a zero because they do not inspect or visit family child care homes prior to the state granting a license.
- Eight states received a zero because they either do not require licensing for small family child care homes or they allow more than six children (including the provider's own children) to be cared for in a home without requiring licensing. For these states, required licensing begins with large family child care homes when seven or more children are in the family child care home.

### **Changes from zero in 2010**

- *Georgia and Kansas* no longer score zero because they now inspect family child care homes before licensing them.

- In this report, *Iowa's* threshold for family child care is defined as six instead of seven as clarified by state licensing staff that the provider's own children are counted in the state threshold. Therefore, *Iowa* is included in states that license small family child care and no longer receives a zero related to licensing threshold.

However, because the state does not inspect family child care homes before licensing, the state still receives a zero. Had an inspection occurred prior to licensing, *Iowa* would have received a score of 31.

### **Change to zero score**

- In *Nebraska*, credit was allocated in NACCRRRA's 2010 report for inspecting before licensing. However, during the state's 2012 review, state licensing staff clarified that the state does not require an inspection before licensing. (Therefore, this is a change in the 2012 report unrelated to a change in policy).

The following table shows the top 10 states. It also includes information about the states that scored zero. Eight states scored zero because they do not inspect family child care homes before licensing. The score they would have received if they did inspect before licensing is shown in parentheses.

Eight states scored zero because they define the threshold of licensing at more than six children (when the provider's own children and exempted first family are included).

<b>Top 10 States and States Scoring Zero: Total Scores and Rankings for Program Requirements and Oversight</b>					
<b>Top 10 States</b>			<b>States Scoring Zero</b>		
<b>State</b>	<b>Final Score*</b>	<b>Rank</b>	<b>State</b>	<b>Final Score*</b>	<b>Rank</b>
Oklahoma	120	1	Michigan**	0 (107)	37
Washington	119	2	Montana**	0 (65)	38
Kansas	111	3	West Virginia**	0 (64)	39
Delaware	109	4	Pennsylvania**	0 (41)	40
Department of Defense	107	5	South Carolina**	0 (39)	41
Maryland	102	6	Nebraska**	0 (34)	42
Alabama	97	7	Iowa**	0 (31)	43
District of Columbia	96	8	Texas**	0 (15)	44
Colorado	95	9	Idaho^	0	52
Massachusetts	86	10	Indiana^	0	52
Total Maximum Score: 150			Louisiana^	0	52
			Mississippi^	0	52
			New Jersey^	0	52
			Ohio^	0	52
			South Dakota^	0	52
			Virginia^	0	52

\* Final scores reflect an adjustment based on the number of children paid providers could care for before being licensed.

\*\* States receive a zero if they do not inspect family child care homes prior to issuing a license. The score these states otherwise would have received is listed to the right of the zero. They are ranked at the bottom of the chart 37<sup>th</sup> in order reflecting their total points. For example, Michigan ranked 37<sup>th</sup> because Michigan would have received the highest total of points (107) among states scoring zero.

^ States receive a zero if the number of children that a provider can care for without a license exceeds six.

The following table shows the total score, percent of total score and rankings for all the states in rank order.

<b>Total Score and Rankings for All States, in Rank Order</b>			
<b>State</b>	<b>Final Score*</b>	<b>Percent of Total Score</b>	<b>Rank</b>
Oklahoma	120	80%	1
Washington	119	79%	2
Kansas	111	74%	3
Delaware	109	73%	4
Department Of Defense	107	71%	5
Maryland	102	68%	6
Alabama	97	65%	7
District Of Columbia	96	64%	8
Colorado	95	63%	9
Massachusetts	86	57%	10
Georgia	84	56%	11
Florida	81	54%	12
New York	72	48%	13
North Carolina	69	46%	14
Connecticut	66	44%	15
Hawaii	64	43%	16
Illinois	60	40%	17
Minnesota	60	40%	17
Rhode Island	60	40%	17
Kentucky	59	39%	20
New Hampshire	59	39%	20
Wisconsin	59	39%	20
Arizona	53	35%	23
New Mexico	50	33%	24
Missouri	50	33%	24
Tennessee	49	33%	26
Wyoming	49	33%	26
Alaska	48	32%	28
Arkansas	48	32%	28
Utah	48	32%	28
Maine	46	31%	31
North Dakota	46	31%	31
Vermont	40	27%	33
California	38	25%	34
Oregon	36	24%	35

<b>Total Score and Rankings for All States, in Rank Order</b>			
<b>State</b>	<b>Final Score*</b>	<b>Percent of Total Score</b>	<b>Rank</b>
Nevada	34	23%	36
Michigan**	0 (107)	0% (71%)	37
Montana**	0 (65)	0% (43%)	38
West Virginia**	0 (64)	0% (43%)	39
Pennsylvania**	0 (41)	0% (27%)	40
South Carolina**	0 (39)	0% (26%)	41
Nebraska**	0 (34)	0% (23%)	42
Iowa**	0 (31)	0% (21%)	43
Texas**	0 (15)	0% (10%)	44
Idaho^	0	0%	52
Indiana^	0	0%	52
Louisiana^	0	0%	52
Mississippi^	0	0%	52
New Jersey^	0	0%	52
Ohio^	0	0%	52
South Dakota^	0	0%	52
Virginia^	0	0%	52

\*Final scores reflect an adjustment based on the number of children paid providers could care for before being licensed.

\*\* States receive a zero if they do not inspect family child care homes prior to issuing a license. The score these states otherwise would have received is listed to the right of the zero. They are ranked at the bottom of the chart beginning with rank 37 in order reflecting their total points. For example, Michigan ranked 37<sup>th</sup> because Michigan would have received the highest total of points (107) among states scoring zero.

^States receive a zero if the number of children that a provider can care for without a license exceeds six.

## States That Scored Zero

States Scoring Zero		
States	Number of States	Reason for Scoring Zero
Iowa, Michigan, Montana, Nebraska, Pennsylvania, South Carolina, Texas, West Virginia	8	No inspection is required before licensing or mandatory regulation.
Idaho, Indiana, Louisiana, Mississippi, New Jersey, Ohio, South Dakota, Virginia.	8	Does not require a license for small family child care homes. <i>(States allow more than 6 children in the home before requiring a license).</i>

States Scoring Zero by Number of Children in the Home Before Licensing					
State	Final Score*	Rank	Number of Children When Regulation Begins**		
			Licensing Regulation Threshold	Provider's Children Counted	First Family Exempt
Idaho^	0	52	7	Yes	No
Indiana^	0	52	6	No	No
Louisiana^	0	52	7	No	No
Mississippi^	0	52	6	No	No
New Jersey^	0	52	6	No	No
Ohio^	0	52	7	Yes	No
South Dakota^	0	52	13	Yes	No
Virginia^	0	52	6	No	No
<b>Total possible score is 150</b>					

\*Final scores reflect an adjustment based on the number of children paid providers could care for before being licensed.

\*\*To derive the total number of children in care, NACCRRRA started with the number of children in care when state licensing begins. One child was added if the state does not include the provider's own children in the licensing threshold. One child was added for each family exempted before licensing begins.

^ States either do not license small family child care, or the number of children (including the provider's own children) the provider can care for is seven or above.

The following table shows the total score, percent of total score and rankings for all the states in alphabetical order.

<b>Total Score and Rankings for All States in Alphabetical Order</b>			
<b>States</b>	<b>Final Score*</b>	<b>Percent of Total Score</b>	<b>Rank</b>
Alabama	97	65%	7
Alaska	48	32%	28
Arizona	53	35%	23
Arkansas	48	32%	28
California	38	25%	34
Colorado	95	63%	9
Connecticut	66	44%	15
Delaware	109	73%	4
Department Of Defense	107	71%	5
District Of Columbia	96	64%	8
Florida	81	54%	12
Georgia	84	56%	11
Hawaii	64	43%	16
Idaho^	0	0%	52
Illinois	60	40%	17
Indiana^	0	0%	52
Iowa**	0 (31)	0% (21%)	43
Kansas	111	74%	3
Kentucky	59	39%	20
Louisiana^	0	0%	52
Maine	46	31%	31
Maryland	102	68%	6
Massachusetts	86	57%	10
Michigan**	0 (107)	0% (71%)	37
Minnesota	60	40%	17
Mississippi^	0	0%	52
Missouri	49	33%	25
Montana**	0 (65)	0% (43%)	38
Nebraska**	0 (34)	0% (23%)	42
Nevada	34	23%	36
New Hampshire	59	39%	20
New Jersey^	0	0%	52
New Mexico	50	33%	24
New York	72	48%	13
North Carolina	69	46%	14
North Dakota	46	31%	31
Ohio^	0	0%	52
Oklahoma	120	80%	1
Oregon	36	24%	35
Pennsylvania**	0 (41)	0% (27%)	40

**Total Score and Rankings for All States  
in Alphabetical Order**

<b>States</b>	<b>Final Score*</b>	<b>Percent of Total</b>	<b>Rank</b>
Rhode Island	60	40%	17
South Carolina**	0 (39)	0% (26%)	41
South Dakota^	0	0%	52
Tennessee	49	33%	25
Texas**	0 (15)	0% (10%)	44
Utah	48	32%	28
Vermont	40	27%	33
Virginia^	0	0%	52
Washington	119	79%	2
West Virginia**	0 (64)	0% (43%)	39
Wisconsin	59	39%	20
Wyoming	49	33%	25

\*Final scores reflect an adjustment based on the number of children paid providers could care for before being licensed.

\*\* States receive a zero if they do not inspect family child care homes prior to issuing a license. The score these states otherwise would have received is listed to the right of the zero.

^States receive a zero if the number of children that a provider can care for without a license exceeds six.

The following table shows the total score, percent of total score and rankings for all the states in alphabetical order. It shows the number of children when regulation is required. The last column shows whether an inspection is required before a licensed is granted.

<b>Total Scores and Rankings for Program Requirements and Oversight</b>							
<b>In Alphabetical Order with Licensing Thresholds</b>							
State	Final Score*	Percent of Total Score	Rank	Number of Children When Regulation Begins*			Visit Before Licensing**
				Licensing Requirement #	Provider's Children Counted	First Family Exempt	
Alabama	97	65%	7	1	N/A	No	Yes
Alaska	48	32%	28	5	No	No	Yes
Arizona	53	35%	23	5	No	No	Yes
Arkansas	48	32%	28	6	Yes	No	Yes
California	38	25%	34	2 <sup>nd</sup> Family	No	Yes	Yes
Colorado	95	63%	9	2 <sup>nd</sup> Family	No	Yes	Yes
Connecticut	66	44%	15	1	N/A	No	Yes
Delaware	109	73%	4	1	N/A	No	Yes
Department Of Defense	107	71%	5	1	N/A	No	Yes
District Of Columbia	96	64%	8	1	N/A	No	Yes
Florida	81	54%	12	2nd Family	No	Yes	Yes
Georgia	84	56%	11	3	No	No	Yes
Hawaii	64	43%	16	3	No	No	Yes
Idaho^	0	0%	52	7	Yes	No	Yes
Illinois	60	40%	17	4	Yes	Yes	Yes
Indiana^	0	0%	52	6	No	No	Yes
Iowa**	0 (31)	0% (21%)	43	6	Yes	No	No
Kansas	111	74%	3	1	N/A	No	Yes
Kentucky	59	39%	20	4	No	No	Yes
Louisiana^	0	0%	52	7	No	No	Yes
Maine	46	31%	31	3	No	No	Yes
Maryland	102	68%	6	1	N/A	No	Yes
Massachusetts	86	57%	10	1	N/A	No	Yes
Michigan**	0 (107)	0% (71%)	37	1	N/A	No	No
Minnesota	60	40%	17	2 <sup>nd</sup> Family	No	Yes	Yes
Mississippi^	0	0%	52	6	No	No	Yes
Missouri	50	33%	24	5	No	No	Yes
Montana**	0 (65)	0% (43%)	38	3	No	No	No

**Total Scores and Rankings for Program Requirements and Oversight  
In Alphabetical Order with Licensing Thresholds**

State	Final Score*	Percent of Total Score	Rank	Number of Children When Regulation Begins*			Visit Before Licensing**
				Licensing Requirement #	Provider's Children Counted	First Family Exempt	
Nebraska**	0 (34)	0% (23%)	42	4	No	No	No
Nevada	34	23%	36	5	No	No	Yes
New Hampshire	59	39%	20	4	No	No	Yes
New Jersey^	0	0%	52	6	No	No	Yes
New Mexico	50	33%	24	5	No	No	Yes
New York	72	48%	13	3	No	No	Yes
North Carolina	69	46%	14	3	No	No	Yes
North Dakota	46	31%	31	6	Yes	No	Yes
Ohio^	0	0%	52	7	Yes	No	Yes
Oklahoma	120	80%	1	1	N/A	No	Yes
Oregon	36	24%	35	4	No	Yes	Yes
Pennsylvania**	0 (41)	0% (27%)	40	4	No	No	No
Rhode Island	60	40%	17	4	No	No	Yes
South Carolina**	0 (39)	0% (26%)	41	2 <sup>nd</sup> Family	No	Yes	No
South Dakota^	0	0%	52	13	Yes	No	Yes
Tennessee	49	33%	26	5	No	No	Yes
Texas**	0 (15)	0% (10%)	44	1	N/A	No	No
Utah	48	32%	28	5	No	No	Yes
Vermont	40	27%	33	3 <sup>rd</sup> Family	No	Yes	Yes
Virginia^	0	0%	52	6	No	No	Yes
Washington	119	79%	2	1	N/A	No	Yes
West Virginia**	0 (64)	0% (43%)	39	4	Yes	No	No
Wisconsin	59	39%	20	4	No	No	Yes
Wyoming	49	33%	26	3	No	Yes	Yes
Total possible score is 150							

\*Final scores reflect an adjustment based on the number of children paid providers could care for before being licensed.

\*\* States receive a zero if they do not inspect family child care homes prior to issuing a license. The score these states otherwise would have received is listed to the right of the zero.

^States receive a zero if the number of children that a provider can care for without a license exceeds six.

# This report scores the lowest level of regulation in states (i.e., the level at which regulation is mandatory for all providers). In Texas, licensing begins with the 4<sup>th</sup> child, but providers caring for 1-3 children are required to be listed. Therefore, this report reviews requirements for listed care. In South Carolina, providers are required to be registered with the second family (2-6 children). Licensing is not required until a provider is caring for 7 children in the home. This report reviews requirements for registered care because it is the lowest level of mandatory regulation.

The following table shows the scores and ranks for the top 10 states for oversight and the top 10 states for program requirements.

Top 10 States for Oversight Scores and Ranks			Top 10 States for Program Scores and Ranks		
State	Oversight Scores and Rank		State	Program Scores and Rank	
	Score*	Rank		Score*	Rank
Oklahoma	38	1	Washington	90	1
Kansas	34	2	Delaware	83	2
Maryland	29	3	Oklahoma	82	3
Washington	29	3	Department Of Defense	80	4
Florida	28	5	Massachusetts	80	4
Department Of Defense	27	6	Kansas	77	6
Delaware	26	7	Alabama	75	7
New York	25	8	Maryland	73	8
District Of Columbia	24	9	Colorado	72	9
Colorado	23	10	District Of Columbia	72	9
North Carolina	23	10			

\*Final scores reflect an adjustment based on the number of children paid providers could care for before being licensed.

Seven states and DoD are in the top 10 for both oversight and program standards: (*Colorado, Delaware, the District of Columbia, Kansas, Maryland, Oklahoma and Washington*) and DoD.